

Faculty Critique Report

09.24.09

I had a favorable review again this time. Both Patricia and Mike made a point to comment that my presentation was “professional”, and overall agreed my project was progressing at a good pace. Everyone involved seems pleased that the background footage has been filmed.

We discussed my concern that the feel of the sequence needs “more Christmas”. I brought up Myles’ suggestion of a diorama for the title, and I think the idea was well received. Patricia cautioned not to spend too much time on the title, but recognizes the opportunity it presents. Both Mike and Patricia suggested adding twinkling to the lights for more life. Bringing the frames alive, in fact, is a recurring point of discussion that I’ll need to continue to address.

It was agreed that I will need to begin working on the effects for the gifts immediately. It is a critical element, and it should be a priority. Mike suggested looking into utilizing Wondertouch Particle Illusion, which I have already considered. We also had a look at some stock footage in the CADA library that may be useful. Patricia suggests “tons of styleframes” to play with the look, which is always a good suggestion.

Regarding the trains, we discussed the important shot where the bed fades up under the train. It was strongly recommended I begin testing this setup, as we all expect it might be tricky. Difference of scale might be a problem, but the panel feels like this shot can be successful, if painful to achieve.

Mike is bothered (as I have been) by the cuts between frames 6-7-8. He suggested softening the cut with a dissolve. Unfortunately, I’ve already got a short dissolve in there and it must not have helped. I’m concerned I’m going to be stuck with it, but I’ll see what can be done.

Patricia liked the color treatment of the styleframe I presented. Mike suggested the moonlight should be cooler. I will need to put some time into the color grading. This process can begin now, even before all the final elements are filmed.

Overall, I thought the review was productive, and the panel agreed. I’ll be getting to work, and I’ll need to set some goals for the next review.

Panel Comments

Patricia Heard-Greene

- shoot looks great
- like the color styleframe
- work in the look of the VFX...you need lots of styleframes, then work into comp
- don't play safe - throw it in and let it give you feedback
- keep the background living with flickering highlights and such

Mike Cushny

- try using dissolves in the sequence when your getting closer to the kid in bed, the jump cuts are a little jarring
- try more blue in the lightsource/moonlight on the bed/kid
- try adding a twinkle/glow to the xmas lights on the bed
- the stars behind the train could be the lights on the bed
- there is a 2D particle generator in Combustion that has a preset for steam engine smoke stack + snow
- try adding the book cover "the night before Christmas" to the opening shot of the bed on the floor next to the wooden train

Thesis Execution Review Evaluation Criteria Form, Fall 2009

The evaluation of your thesis project may be based on but is not limited to the following criteria:

Student Name MATT STALKER

Thesis Panelist (print) AKG

1. Completeness – Did the student deliver all components required by the department in order to fulfill the academic standards for a thesis project? Did the student deliver all components he/she intended to be part of the project?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☐ agree ☐ strongly agree

2. Thesis Statement and Execution – Does the project have a clear and concise concept? Does the execution match the intention as described in the thesis statement?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☐ agree ☐ strongly agree

3. Research – Did the student explore various avenues and apply the most appropriate solution to the project?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☐ agree ☐ strongly agree

4. Originality and Effort – Does the project demonstrate a high level of enthusiasm, ambition, experimentation and challenge?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☐ agree ☐ strongly agree

5. Technical Quality – Did the student choose the appropriate tools and techniques and have they been used with evident skill?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☐ agree ☐ strongly agree

6. Artistic Quality – Did the student develop an artistic concept and an individual design solution appropriate for the idea of the project?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☐ agree ☐ strongly agree

7. Production Value – Did the student 'polish' and refine the project ready for a professional presentation?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☐ agree ☐ strongly agree

8. Presentation Skills – Did the student clearly verbalize and visualize the intent, the process and the success of the project in form of a printed documentation combined with the oral defense?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☐ agree ☐ strongly agree

Final grade recommendation by the Panelist

☐ Pass with Honors

☐ Pass

☐ Incomplete Pass

☐ Fail

Date 9/23/09

Signature 

! Attach an additional page with additional and comments to this paper. Reference your comments with the number index of the grading criteria on this form.

FALL 2009 THESIS EXECUTION REVIEWS - ADDITIONAL COMMENTS

Student Name: MAT STAKER

Panelist Name: PHG

Date: 9/23/09

- shoot look great

- like the color style/home

- work on the look of the VFX

you need lots of style/home
then work into a comp

Don't play safe - throw it in & let it give you feedback

* Keep the background living with flickering lighters
& such.

Thesis Execution Review Evaluation Criteria Form, Fall 2009

The evaluation of your thesis project may be based on but is not limited to the following criteria:

Student Name MATT STALKER

Thesis Panelist (print) CUSHNY

1. Completeness – Did the student deliver all components required by the department in order to fulfill the academic standards for a thesis project? Did the student deliver all components he/she intended to be part of the project?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☒ agree ☐ strongly agree

2. Thesis Statement and Execution – Does the project have a clear and concise concept? Does the execution match the intention as described in the thesis statement?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☒ agree ☐ strongly agree

3. Research – Did the student explore various avenues and apply the most appropriate solution to the project?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☒ agree ☐ strongly agree

4. Originality and Effort – Does the project demonstrate a high level of enthusiasm, ambition, experimentation and challenge?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☒ agree ☐ strongly agree

5. Technical Quality – Did the student choose the appropriate tools and techniques and have they been used with evident skill?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☒ agree ☐ strongly agree

6. Artistic Quality – Did the student develop an artistic concept and an individual design solution appropriate for the idea of the project?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☒ agree ☐ strongly agree

7. Production Value – Did the student 'polish' and refine the project ready for a professional presentation?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☒ agree ☐ strongly agree

8. Presentation Skills – Did the student clearly verbalize and visualize the intent, the process and the success of the project in form of a printed documentation combined with the oral defense?

☐ strongly disagree ☐ disagree ☒ agree ☐ strongly agree

Final grade recommendation by the Panelist

☐ Pass with Honors ☒ Pass ☐ Incomplete Pass ☐ Fail

Date 9/23/09 Signature 

! Attach an additional page with additional and comments to this paper. Reference your comments with the number index of the grading criteria on this form.

FALL 2009 THESIS EXECUTION REVIEWS - ADDITIONAL COMMENTS

Student Name: MATT

Panelist Name: CUSHNY

Date: 9/23/09

try using dissolves in the sequence when
you are getting closer to the kid in Bed, the
jump cuts are a little jarring

try more blue in the lightsource / moonlight on the
Bed / kid

try adding a twinkle / glow to the xmas lights on the Bed

the stars behind the train could be the lights on
the Bed. Twinkling

there is a 2D particle generator in Combustion that
has a preset for steam engine smoke stack, & snow

try adding the Book cover "the night before christmas"
to the opening shot of the Bed, on the floor next to the
wooden train.

- more christmas
- color flash lights
- how lighting ~~will~~ will react with the rest of room
- play with your ideas, test things out
- work on tones, highlights
- test train setups
- get designs down BEFORE shooting

* very
nice animatic
+
presentation

Matt

Best way to figure stuff out is to try it
You don't want to be too solid,
Just do it!!

Think about the way people visualize - Xmas
Highlights on Christmas bulbs.

A big suggestion would be to
get your Footage of the train within
the stylesheet.

Make it dreamy.

[With the train set can you set
up it partially & take measurements
just so you can get some
mock material.

You may shoot things differently
May add a bit more magic
even w/ distortion.

Its nice to see the work in progress
Even though your effects weren't
ready it was nice & professional.